

EPPING FOREST DISTRICT COUNCIL COMMITTEE MINUTES

Committee: Area Planning Subcommittee **Date:** 20 April 2011
South

Place: Roding Valley High School, Brook Road, Loughton, Essex IG10 3JA **Time:** 7.30 - 9.00 pm

Members Present: K Chana (Vice-Chairman, in the Chair), K Angold-Stephens, R Barrett, Mrs T Cochrane, R Cohen, D Dodeja, Ms J Hart, J Knapman, L Leonard, A Lion, Mrs C Pond, Mrs P Richardson, B Sandler, P Spencer, Mrs J Sutcliffe, H Ulkun, Mrs L Wagland, Ms S Watson and D Wixley

Other Councillors:

Apologies: J Hart, C Finn, J Markham and G Mohindra

Officers Present: S Solon (Principal Planning Officer), A Hendry (Democratic Services Officer), S G Hill (Senior Democratic Services Officer) and P Sewell (Democratic Services Assistant)

100. WEBCASTING INTRODUCTION

The Chairman made a short address to remind all present that the meeting would be broadcast on the Internet, and that the Council had adopted a protocol for the webcasting of its meetings.

101. MINUTES

RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the last meeting of the Sub-committee held on 30 March 2011 be taken as read and signed by the Chairman as a correct record.

102. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

a) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillors D Dodeja, Mrs J Sutcliffe, P Spencer and Mrs S Watson declared a personal interest in the following items of the agenda by virtue of being members of Buckhurst Hill Parish Council. The Councillors had declared that their interests were not prejudicial and that they would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/2652/10 - Former Electrical Sub-Station, Station Way, Buckhurst Hill
- EPF/0031/11 - Broom House, Little Plucketts Way, Buckhurst Hill
- EPF/0554/11 - Holly House Private Hospital, High Road, Buckhurst Hill

b) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor P Richardson declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda by virtue of being a member of Loughton Town Council. The Councillor had declared that her interests were not prejudicial and that she would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/0481/11 – 68 Wellfields, Loughton

c) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor Ken Angold-Stephens, C Pond and D Wixley declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda by virtue of being members of the Loughton Residents Association and Loughton Town Council. The Councillors had declared that their interest were not prejudicial and that they would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/0481/11 – 68 Wellfields, Loughton

d) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor L Leonard, T Cochrane and Jennie Hart declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda by virtue of being a member of Loughton Residents Association and that Ms Hart also used the Dental Surgery next door to the application. The Councillors had declared that their interest were not prejudicial and that they would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/0481/11 – 68 Wellfields, Loughton

e) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor T Cochrane declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda by virtue of knowing one of the objectors. The Councillor had declared that her interests were not prejudicial and that she would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/2652/10 – Former Electrical Sub-Station, Station Way, Buckhurst Hill

f) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor T Cochrane declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda by virtue of being a family member of one of the objectors. The Councillor had declared that her interests were prejudicial and that she would leave the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/0031/11 – Broom House, Little Plucketts Way, Buckhurst Hill

g) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor D Wixley declared a personal interest in the following items of the agenda by virtue of being a Tree Warden. The Councillor had declared that his interests were not prejudicial and that he would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/2652/10 – Former Electrical Sub-Station, Station Way, Buckhurst Hill
- EPF/0554/11 – Holly House Private Hospital, High Road, Buckhurst Hill

103. APPOINTMENT OF VICE CHAIRMAN

In the absence of the Chairman, the Vice-Chairman assumed the role of Chairman and requested a nomination for the role of Vice-Chairman.

RESOLVED:

That Councillor Mrs L Wagland be elected Vice-Chairman for the duration of the meeting.

104. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

It was noted that there was no urgent business for consideration by the Sub-Committee.

105. DEVELOPMENT CONTROL

The Sub-Committee considered a schedule of applications for planning permission.

RESOLVED:

That the planning applications numbered 1 – 4 be determined as set out in the attached schedule to these minutes.

106. DELEGATED DECISIONS

The Sub-Committee noted that schedules of planning applications determined by the Director of Planning and Economic Development under delegated authority since the last meeting had been circulated and could be inspected at the Civic Offices.

CHAIRMAN

This page is intentionally left blank

Report Item No: 1

APPLICATION No:	EPF/2652/10
SITE ADDRESS:	Former Electrical Substation Station Way Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9
PARISH:	Buckhurst Hill
WARD:	Buckhurst Hill East
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Demolition of existing sub station and facilities building and erection of 3/4 storey block of 11 no. two bed flats with associated car parking.
DECISION:	Refuse Permission

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=524108

Members were particularly concerned about the quality and form of the proposed development and the cumulative impact of the existing demand for on-street parking and additional demand for on-street parking likely to be generated by the development. The design of the proposed building was found to be particularly poor with little interest and a lack of respect for the character of the locality. Its bulk and siting was found to be harmful to the amenities of the occupants of neighbouring properties. Having regard to the shortcomings of the proposal and the consequences for its layout if it were revised to accord with the 2009 parking standards, Members found it to be an unsympathetic over-development of the site.

Concern was also expressed about the lack of information submitted with the application in respect of the exposure of the site to noise. Members took the view that this matter could not reasonably be dealt with by a planning condition since the form and layout of the proposal might be materially affected by the steps necessary to comply with such a condition.

REASONS FOR REFUSAL

- 1 By reason of its bulk and flat roofed design the proposed block of flats would have a poor appearance that fails to respect its setting and the character and appearance of the locality, contrary to policies CP2(iv), CP3 (v), CP7 and DBE1 of the Epping Forest District Local Plan and Alterations.
- 2 By reason of its height and siting adjacent to the rear garden boundaries of neighbouring dwellinghouses in Walnut Way together with the difference in levels between the site and neighbouring gardens, the proposed block of flats would appear excessively overbearing when seen from adjacent residential properties to the detriment of the amenities enjoyed by their occupants. Accordingly the proposed development is contrary to policies CP7 and DBE9 of the Epping Forest District Local Plan and Alterations.

- 3 By reason of its inadequate provision of off-street parking spaces the proposed development fails to comply with the September 2009 Parking Standards. As a consequence it is likely to exacerbate a high demand for on-street parking in the locality to the detriment of its character. Accordingly the proposed development is contrary to policies CP2(iv), CP3 (v), CP7 and ST6 of the Epping Forest District Local Plan and Alterations.
- 4 As demonstrated by its poor design, over-dominant appearance and lack of off-street parking provision the proposal would be an unsympathetic over-development of the site to the detriment of the character and visual amenities of the locality contrary to policies CP2(iv), CP3 (v), CP7 and DBE1 of the Epping Forest District Local Plan and Alterations.
- 5 The proposal is for a noise sensitive development. By reason of its siting in very close proximity to a railway the proposed flats and associated private amenity space would be exposed to high levels of noise. The failure to submit a noise survey for the site sufficient to establish which noise exposure category it falls within prevents proper assessment of whether it is possible to mitigate the adverse impact of noise on the living conditions of the occupants of the flats and whether the development can be carried out in the form proposed. As a consequence it is not appropriate to deal with this matter by the imposition of a planning condition and therefore the development is contrary to policy RP5A of the Epping Forest District Local Plan and Alterations.

Report Item No: 2

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0031/11
SITE ADDRESS:	Broom House Little Plucketts Way Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 5QU
PARISH:	Buckhurst Hill
WARD:	Buckhurst Hill West
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Erection of double storey rear extension from lower ground floor (basement), front car parking canopy, loft floor alteration with dormer and roof light windows.
DECISION:	Deferred

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniTelM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=524377

Having regard to the exceptional circumstances preventing the owner of 1 Little Plucketts Way from being able to address the Committee in person in connection with this application, Members resolved to defer considering the application until the next meeting of the Committee when that person would be able to address the Committee.

Report Item No: 3

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0481/11
SITE ADDRESS:	68 Wellfields Loughton Essex IG10 1NY
PARISH:	Loughton
WARD:	Loughton St Marys
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Demolition of existing house and garage, and construction of new house. (Revised application)
DECISION:	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=526222

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 No development shall have taken place until details of the types and colours of the external finishes of the house hereby approved have been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority in writing prior to the commencement of the development. The development shall be implemented in accordance with such approved details.
- 3 Prior to first occupation of the development hereby approved, the proposed window opening(s) in the first floor flank elevation(s) shall be entirely fitted with obscured glass and have fixed frames to a height of 1.7 metres above the floor of the room in which the window is installed and shall be permanently retained in that condition.
- 4 Notwithstanding the provisions of the Town and Country Planning General Permitted Development Order 1995 as amended (or any other order revoking, further amending or re-enacting that order) no extensions generally permitted by virtue of Schedule 2, Part 1, Class A shall be undertaken without the prior written permission of the Local Planning Authority.
- 5 No development, including site clearance, shall take place until a scheme of soft landscaping and a statement of the methods, including a timetable, for its Implementation (linked to the development schedule), have been submitted to the Local Planning Authority and approved in writing. The landscape scheme shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details and the agreed timetable. If any plant dies, becomes diseased or fails to thrive within a period of 5 years from the date of planting, or is removed, uprooted or destroyed, it must be replaced by another plant of the same kind and size and at the same place, unless the Local Planning Authority agrees to a variation beforehand in writing.

- 6 All material excavated from the below ground works hereby approved shall be removed from the site unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 7 No development shall take place until wheel washing or other cleaning facilities for vehicles leaving the site during construction works have been installed. The installed cleaning facilities shall be used to clean vehicles immediately before leaving the site.
- 8 All construction/demolition works and ancillary operations, including vehicle movement on site which are audible at the boundary of noise sensitive premises, shall only take place between the hours of 07.30 to 18.30 Monday to Friday and 08.00 to 13.00 hours on Saturday, and at no time during Sundays and Public/Bank Holidays unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Report Item No: 4

APPLICATION No:	EPF/0554/11
SITE ADDRESS:	Holly House Private Hospital High Road Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 5HX
PARISH:	Buckhurst Hill
WARD:	Buckhurst Hill West
DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL:	Replacement of a single portakabin with a double stacked portakabin in the grounds of the existing hospital for use as temporary office accommodation (Revised application EPF/2481/10)
DECISION:	Grant Permission (With Conditions)

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=526487

CONDITIONS

- 1 This consent shall inure for a limited period expiring 18 months (a year and a half) from the date of this Notice, at which time the development permitted by this Notice shall be discontinued and the building shall be removed from the site together with any associated materials, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- 2 Prior to first occupation of the development hereby approved, the proposed window opening(s) in the first floor south flank elevation(s) shall be entirely fitted with obscured glass and have fixed frames to a height of 1.7 metres above the floor of the room in which the window is installed and shall be permanently retained in that condition.
- 3 The entrance(s) to the top level portakabin and any associated stair shall only be to the northern elevation of the development hereby approved.